# Clean Heat Standard

The following questions were developed by the Just Transitions Subcommittee to help each Subcommittee put the Guiding Principles into practice. They aim to better identify, understand, and address the social impacts, types of impacted populations, and engagement process of individual policy recommendations. These are not comprehensive, but rather indicative of the analysis required to ensure a Just Transition for Vermont.

### IMPACTED & FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES

* Which frontline and impacted communities might be most impacted by this recommendation?
* How do these communities experience inequity today around this issue?

### ANALYZING BURDENS & BENEFITS

* Does this recommendation maintain existing inequities, make them worse or improve the status quo?
* Who will benefit from this recommendation and how does this recommendation help benefits be shared or targeted to help frontline and impacted communities the most? Be specific about the communities and the ways these communities will benefit.
* Which communities will be burdened the most by this recommendation and how can that burden be shifted away from impacted communities?
* What are the long-term and potential intergenerational impacts of this recommendation for identified communities?

### ENSURING EQUITABLE & JUST ENGAGEMENT

* How have frontline and impacted communities been part of creating and implementing this recommendation? And how will they in the future?
* In what ways does your engagement with frontline/impacted communities recognize different types of knowledge and expertise?
* In what ways can Vermonters hear their voices in the plan?
* Does the recommendation use plain language that is easy for all Vermonters to understand?

### FUNDING & DATA

* How will this recommendation be funded? What percent of funding will be specifically to support frontline, low-income and impacted communities? Will there enough funding to make it affordable and accessible for identified communities?
* How will we know about the impacts of this recommendation on identified communities? Which data or indicators will be needed? What process was used to determine the indicators are resonate and relevant to most impacted community needs? How will it be collected and shared?

### IMPLEMENTATION & OUTCOMES

* What kind of jobs will be created by this recommendation? Will those jobs be fair, high- paying jobs with good benefits? How will traditionally underserved Vermonters and unions be prioritized for these jobs?
* What capacity is needed for communities, local/regional governments, organizations and families to implement this recommendation? How will the recommendation build and/or strengthen capacity, community trust, cooperation, and mutual support?
* How does this recommendation make a specific commitment to a just transition? Is this commitment quantifiable and does it identify who is accountable?
* Does the recommendation support the natural environment? Does it promote fairness to all living things?

# Scoring Rubric

The Rubric is intended to accompany a narrative response for each of the Assessment Questions in Section V. In reviewing the proposal, please consider the Rubric’s prompts and their resonance to the goals and vision of this project. An area is provided for comments. The Rubric allows a score of 1 (low) to 3 (high) for each criteria.

1 (low): The proposal meets the criteria to some degree but provides limited explanation or there are significant opportunities to enhance this criteria in the proposal.

2 (moderate): The proposal meets the criteria. There are additional opportunities to enhance this criteria to better meet the goals of the Guiding Principles.

3 (high): The proposal excels in meeting the criteria.

If a recommendation does not yet address the criteria at all, additional work is required.

**Policy/Proposal Title:** Clean Heat Standard

**Policy/Proposal Summary:**

Building on the success of Renewable Portfolio Standards (RPSs) that have worked well to transform the electricity sector, Vermont should create a Clean Heat performance Standard (CHS), applied on a competitively neutral basis to all major suppliers of heating fuels in Vermont.  As we reduce reliance on fossil heat, a Clean Heat Standard would support a range of cleaner options, including advanced wood heat (wood chips and pellets), liquid biofuels, renewable natural gas, and high-efficiency heat pumps. Creating a sure market for these choices would provide a path to new lines of business for Vermont’s critically-important heating suppliers.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Frontline/Impacted Communities**  Score 1 – 3 on impression of meeting criteria | **Please select 1 low to high 3** | | |
| Frontline/Most Impacted Communities well defined in proposal | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| Proposal reflects understanding of existing inequities around the issue for frontline/most impacted communities | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| **Total** |  | | |
| **Analyzing Burdens and Benefits**  Score 1 – 3 on impression of meeting criteria | **Please select 1 low to high 3** | | |
| Proposal clearly identifies how benefits are shared for frontline/most impacted  communities | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| Proposal clearly identifies who/what carries the burdens from the recommendation, if any | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| Proposal includes solutions to shield frontline/most impacted communities from experiencing burdens from the recommendation, if applicable | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| Proposal outlines the long-term/intergenerational impacts (positive or negative) of recommendations on impacted communities | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| Proposal outlines how it will create a future that is more equitable than the unjust status quo | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| **Total** |  | | |
| **Ensuring Equitable & Just Engagement**  Score 1 – 3 on impression of meeting criteria | **Please select 1 low to high 3** | | |
| Proposal reflects inclusion of frontline/impacted communities in design and implementation of recommendation | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| Vermonters can hear their voices in the recommendation | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| Recommendation written in plain language and easy to understand | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| **Total** |  | | |
| **Funding & Data**  Score 1 – 3 on impression of meeting criteria | **Please select 1 low to high 3** | | |
| Funding mechanism for recommendation is clearly defined | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| Funding mechanism makes recommendation affordable and accessible to frontline/most impacted communities, if applicable | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| Proposal identifies data and indicators to determine success | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| Proposal includes process for consultation with frontline/most impacted communities in assessment activities | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| Proposal includes plan for collection and review of data with frontline/most impacted communities | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| **Total** |  | | |
| **Implementation & Outcomes**  Score 1 – 3 on impression of meeting criteria | **Please select 1 low to high 3** | | |
| Proposal identifies new jobs/business/employment opportunities for the recommendation | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| Jobs created by recommendation offer fair, high paying positions with good benefits | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| A wide range of traditionally underserved Vermonters and unions are prioritized in the jobs created by the recommendation | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| Communities, local/regional governments, organizations and families have the capacity to implement the recommendation. | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| The recommendation provides a specific, quantifiable commitment to a just transition | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| The recommendation supports the natural environment and promotes fairness to all living things | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Comments: |  |  |  |
| **Total** |  | | |

**Total scoring (21 low to 63 high):**