

Vermont Barn Preservation Grants 2023 Selection Criteria *Advisory Council Scoring Guidelines*

All applicants/eligible buildings *must* meet Criteria 1 through 4. Criteria 5 through 10 are used to rate and rank each project, using a competitive numerical scoring system. The Vermont Advisory Council for Historic Preservation (Council) will evaluate each project by these criteria and assigns points. Projects will be funded in rank-order until funding is exhausted. The criteria will be weighted as follows:

<i>Criteria 1-4</i>	<i>All applicants must meet these criteria</i>
<i>Criterion 5</i>	<i>0-5 points possible</i>
<i>Criterion 6</i>	<i>0-5 points possible</i>
<i>Criterion 7</i>	<i>0-2 points possible</i>
<i>Criterion 8</i>	<i>0-5 points possible</i>
<i>Criterion 9</i>	<i>0-2 points possible</i>
<i>Criterion 10</i>	<i>0-2 points possible</i>

Maximum Total Points: 21

A brief explanation follows for each Criterion. All projects must meet the first four criteria.

Criterion 1: THE PROPERTY MUST BE LISTED ON OR ELIGIBLE FOR LISTING IN THE NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES

Buildings can be listed either individually or as a contributing resource in a National Register Historic District. If the status of a property is unknown, applicants are encouraged to call the Division for Historic Preservation (VDHP). Properties not listed in the National Register will be evaluated for National Register eligibility at the time grant applications are reviewed.

Criterion 2: PROJECT BUILDINGS MUST BE A HISTORIC AGRICULTURAL BUILDING

See the Grants Manual for more information.

Criterion 3: THE APPLICANT MUST MATCH THE GRANT WITH CASH ON NO LESS THAN A 50/50 BASIS

Applicants may apply for no more than 50% of the total project cost, up to a maximum of \$15,000. The applicant's *matching* share must be in-hand/ available at the time the application is submitted. Projects may utilize donated labor and materials, but these cannot be counted towards the match. State funds are not eligible for use as match, but federal funds, private foundation grants, or donor pledges may be used.

Criterion 4: AWARDED PROJECTS MUST DEMONSTRATE COMPLIANCE WITH THE SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION

It is expected that all work completed as part of a Preservation Grant-funded project will meet the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for Rehabilitation*. Projects where work does not meet the *Standards* are not eligible for funding. If proposed work does not meet the *Standards* but could be brought into compliance, the Council may, at its discretion fund a project with conditions.

Criterion 5: PRIORITY WILL BE GIVEN TO PROJECTS THAT BEST PRESERVE HISTORIC BUILDING FEATURES (0-5 points possible)

Applications will be scored on how well the project will contribute to preserving the features of the building that make it eligible for listing in the National Register. Applicants must demonstrate a wholistic approach with clear prioritization of work that will ensure long-term preservation of the building and its character-defining features. Grants may be awarded in any of the following three categories of preservation work. This list of project types is not ranked and projects in each category will be evaluated on an equal basis.

1. Stabilization and Immediate Need:

Projects in this category involve work on a failed structural component, such as a frame, foundation, or roof. Work could also address extensive damage or deterioration over a large portion of the building. For example, a stone foundation that requires extensive repointing. A project can also seek to rectify serious ongoing deterioration and damage to significant character-defining features of a building, such as structural repairs to a cupola, relaying of a slate roof, or timber framing repairs. Immediate need indicates that without repair of the feature, complete deterioration or failure will happen quickly.

2. Necessary Repairs and Corrective Measures:

Projects in this category involve work to restore or repair damaged or deteriorated parts of a building before the deterioration becomes so advanced that the feature must be replaced entirely, or before repairs become extremely costly. This can include a single building component or a package of smaller items, which together make up a significant project. It can include corrective measures such as drainage work, or maintenance work such as window, trim and siding, or door repair.

3. Enhancement and Restoration:

This category consists of work that is not vital to the physical survival of the building, but instead preserves, restores, and enhances features critical to its architectural and/or historical significance. Examples include restoration a distinctive cupola or high-drive. Projects that propose to replace missing architectural features must be supported by photographs, architectural drawings, and/or on-site physical evidence that sufficiently documents the missing element. This documentation must be submitted with the grant application.

The grant program is for restoration work and limited resources excludes funding any "improvements" even if they are important to the use of the building. The types of work described above are examples and do not preclude consideration of other projects that meets the intent of one of the three categories.

Projects that are primarily routine maintenance (e.g. cleaning, painting, etc.) will **not** be given high priority. Painting is generally considered to be routine maintenance. If a grant request does include painting, the applicant must explain any need for associated preparatory work prior to painting in the application. For example, preparatory work includes necessary repairs to wood damaged through paint failure.

Repair is preferable to replacement. If replacement is required, it is almost always best to use the same material. Only in extreme cases will projects utilizing non-historic materials be considered. Substitute materials may be considered if they are compatible with the historic materials in appearance and physical properties, and if they meet performance expectations over a long period of time.

Temporary repairs will be funded only under extraordinary circumstances. Applicants who propose temporary repairs must include a written outline that describes how and when permanent repairs will be undertaken, and how and when funding will be obtained.

Criterion 6: PRIORITY WILL BE GIVEN TO PROJECTS THAT PROVIDE THE GREATEST BENEFIT TO THE PUBLIC AND PROMOTE THE BEST LONG-TERM USE OF THE PROPERTY (0-5 points possible)

One of the purposes of this program is to promote Vermont's agricultural heritage. Public benefit can be demonstrated if:

- If the barn is open to the public
- It is easily visible to the public from a public road or public places and it plays an important role in the landscape or as part of a farmstead complex
- It is important to the history of the community, is an important community symbol or landmark
- The project will expand or improve the use of an underutilized barn
- The property is accessible to the public and/or conserved to protect important historic, archaeological, and natural resources

The preservation of a historic property is more likely to be ensured if buildings are in active use. The Council may also consider whether the adaptive re-use of a historic agricultural building is compatible and will not require substantial changes to its architectural design or historic character. Points may be given to projects that expand or improve the use of an underutilized agricultural building, so long as it will not compromise those features of the building that make it eligible for listing in the National Register.

Criterion 7: PRIORITY WILL BE GIVEN TO PROJECTS THAT PRESERVE IMPORTANT EXAMPLES OF HISTORIC AGRICULTURAL BUILDING TYPES (0-2 points possible)

Important examples of typical kinds of agricultural buildings, examples of rare types of agricultural buildings, and rare survivors, which provide a record of vanished agricultural practices, will be given points in this category. Typical buildings that represent an era in Vermont farming can be important as well. To assist the Council in scoring this criterion, applicants should reference documentation such as a National Register nomination that identifies the building as exceptional. Applicants are also encouraged to contact VDHP

staff for additional guidance in locating sources that document the special or unique features and attributes of a specific building.

Criterion 8: PRIORITY WILL BE GIVEN TO APPLICANTS WHO PROVIDE A CLEARLY PRIORITIZED PLAN FOR PRESERVATION OF THEIR BUILDING (OR PROPERTY), A WELL-PLANNED BUDGET FOR THE PROJECT, AND DEMONSTRATE A COMMITMENT TO LONG-TERM MAINTENANCE (0-5 points possible)

Applicants may be awarded points based on a clear and thoughtful long-term plan for the building, including:

- prioritization of work needed to put the building into good condition,
- descriptions of the proposed work and the estimated project costs, indicating consideration of the full scope of the project and a project budget that is well organized and based on solid cost projections, and
- a track record of long-term care of the building, or if a new owner, a solid maintenance plan, including plans for future sources of funding.

A detailed written estimate for the work proposed in the application from a qualified contractor is required. It is important that the contractor understands that the project must meet the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for Rehabilitation*. If multiple methods for repair are suggested, an applicant should choose an option which meets the *Standards*. Applicants are also encouraged to have a well-defined plan for routine maintenance and long-term preservation of the building and include a description of those plans in the application.

Criterion 9: PRIORITY WILL BE GIVEN TO PROJECTS THAT INVOLVE AGRICULTURAL BUILDINGS IN ACTIVE AGRICULTURAL USE OR THOSE THAT PROPOSE TO REPAIR A HISTORIC AGRICULTURAL BUILDING NOT IN ACTIVE USE FOR AGRICULTURAL PURPOSES: (0-2 points possible)

Criterion 10: PRIORITY WILL BE GIVEN TO APPLICATIONS THAT ARE CLEAR, CONCISE AND WELL-WRITTEN, WITH ATTACHMENTS THAT EXCEED THE MINIMUM REQUIREMENTS: (0-2 points possible)

Applications should be clear, well-organized, and proofread. Photograph attachments should be clearly labeled and meet all the documentation requirements (see the Grant Manual for additional guidance on photographs). Applicants should include additional reports that are applicable to the project, such as maintenance plans etc. Extraneous material not pertinent to the application should be avoided. Contact Division staff for additional guidance.

BONUS: GEOGRAPHIC DISTRIBUTION MAY BE CONSIDERED AS A FACTOR IN PROJECT SELECTION (1 point possible)

To promote Vermont's agricultural heritage to as wide an audience as possible, the geographic distribution of applications may be considered. Geographic distribution will become a selection factor when applications compete equally in the first ten criteria. A point may be given in this category following initial scoring if needed to break a tie.